Second Temple Jewish *Paideia* in Context

Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft

Edited by
Carl R. Holladay, Matthias Konradt,
Hermann Lichtenberger, Judith Lieu,
Jens Schröter and Gregory E. Sterling

Volume 228

Second Temple Jewish *Paideia* in Context

Edited by
Jason M. Zurawski and Gabriele Boccaccini

DE GRUYTER

ISBN 978-3-11-054606-4
e-ISBN (PDF) 978-3-11-054697-2
e-ISBN (EPUB) 978-3-11-054611-8
ISSN 0171-6441

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
A CIP catalog record for this book has been applied for at the Library of Congress.

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek
Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über http://dnb.dnb.de abrufbar.

© 2017 Walter de Gruyter GmbH, Berlin/Boston
Printing and binding: CPI books GmbH, Leck
♾ Printed on acid-free paper
Printed in Germany

www.degruyter.com

Contents

Jason M. Zurawski and Gabriele Boccaccini
Introduction: Perspectives on Second Temple Jewish *Paideia* from the Fifth Nangeroni Meeting — 1

Jewish Education in Palestine

William M. Schniedewind
Scribal Education in Ancient Israel and Judah into the Persian Period — 11

Frank Ueberschaer
Jewish Education in Ben Sira — 29

Samuel L. Adams
Reassessing the Exclusivism of Ben Sira's Jewish *Paideia* — 47

Elisa Uusimäki
The Formation of a Sage according to Ben Sira — 59

Matthew Goff
Students of God in the House of Torah: Education in the Dead Sea Scrolls — 71

Jewish Education in the Diaspora

Benjamin G. Wright
Greek *Paideia* and the Jewish Community of Alexandria in the Letter of Aristeas — 93

Luca Arcari
The Testament of Orpheus, Aristobulus, and the Derveni Papyrus: Between "Didactic" Hymnography and Alexandrian Exegesis — 113

Patrick Pouchelle
Discipline, Transmission, and Writing: Notes on Education in the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs — 131

Gregory E. Sterling
The School of Moses in Alexandria: An Attempt to Reconstruct the School of Philo — 141

Sean A. Adams
Philo's *Questions* and the Adaptation of Greek Philosophical Curriculum — 167

Anders Klostergaard Petersen
Dissolving the Philosophy-Religion Dichotomy in the Context of Jewish *Paideia*: Wisdom of Solomon, 4 Maccabees, and Philo — 185

David A. deSilva
The Author of 4 Maccabees and Greek *Paideia*: Facets of the Formation of a Hellenistic Jewish Rhetor — 205

Kathy Ehrensperger
Embodying the Ways in Christ: Paul's Teaching of the Nations — 239

Jason von Ehrenkrook
Christians, Pagans, and the Politics of *Paideia* in Late Antiquity — 255

Jason M. Zurawski
Jewish Education and Identity: Towards an Understanding of Second Temple *Paideia* — 267

Index of Modern Authors — 279

Index of Ancient Sources — 285

Jason M. Zurawski and Gabriele Boccaccini

Introduction: Perspectives on Second Temple Jewish *Paideia* from the Fifth Nangeroni Meeting

Despite the incredible strides made in the past century in the understanding of Second Temple Judaism and the strong scholarly interest in Greek and Christian *paideia* and their relationship following the work of Werner Jaeger,[1] the nature of Jewish *paideia* during the period has remained elusive. Compared to the scholarship on Israelite education prior to the Babylonian exile and on the development of the Jewish academies in later rabbinic times,[2] the history of research on post-exilic education has been surprisingly meager. Early research suffered from significant methodological problems, most seriously the uncritical use of rabbinic literature to describe Jewish education centuries earlier.[3] This led to several anachronistic presuppositions, such as the common claim of a universal school system throughout Hellenistic and Roman Judea.

1 Werner Jaeger, *Paideia: Die Formung des griechischen Menschen*, 3 vols. (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1934–47), translated into English as *Paideia: The Ideals of Greek Culture*, 3 vols. (Oxford: Blackwell, 1939–45); *Early Christianity and Greek Paideia* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1961). See also Henri Irénée Marrou, *Histoire de l'éducation dans l'antiquité* (Paris: Le Seuil, 1948), translated into English as *A History of Education in Antiquity* (New York: Sheed and Ward, 1956), esp. 314 ff.

2 On ancient Israelite education, see the reviews of the pertinent literature in James L. Crenshaw, "Education in Ancient Israel," *JBL* 104 (1985): 601–615; Graham I. Davies, "Were there schools in ancient Israel," in *Wisdom in Ancient Israel*, ed. John Day, Robert P. Gordon, and H.G.M. Williamson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 199–211; and James L. Crenshaw, *Education in Ancient Israel: Across the Deadening Silence* (New York: Doubleday, 1998), 4–5 note 6. On the rabbinic side, see, e.g., Ben Tsiyon Rozenfeld and Chava Cassel, *Torah Centers and Rabbinic Activity in Palestine, 70–400 CE: History and Geographic Distribution* (Leiden: Brill, 2010); Robert Brody, *The Geonim of Babylonia and the Shaping of Medieval Jewish Culture* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998).

3 See Fletcher Harper Swift, *Education in Ancient Israel from Earliest Times to 70 A.D.* (Chicago: The Open Court Publishing Company, 1919); Nathan Drazin, *History of Jewish Education from 515 B.C.E. to 220 C.E. (During the Periods of the Second Commonwealth and the Tannaim)*, The Johns Hopkins University Studies in Education 29 (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1940); Ernest Simon, "Hebrew Education in Palestine," *The Journal of Educational Sociology* 22.3 (Nov. 1948): 190–205; Eliezer Ebner, *Elementary Education in Ancient Israel during the Tannaitic Period (10–220 CE)* (New York: Bloch, 1956); Shmuel Safrai, "Education and the Study of the Torah," in *The Jewish People in the First Century*, ed. S. Safrai and M. Stern, CRINT (Assen: Van Gorcum, 1976), 2:945–70.

DOI 10.1515/9783110546972-001

More recent scholarship has often focused on individual texts, authors, or corpora. There have been several important studies on, for example, the role of the Greek preliminary studies in the thought of Philo of Alexandria,[4] and views on Jewish education as related to Ben Sira or the Dead Sea Scrolls have long been a standard aspect of their respective research fields.[5] Studies on the texts of the New Testament in light of Greco-Roman education have also become popular in recent years.[6] Attempts at a more comprehensive picture of Second Temple Jewish education have been rare,[7] yet we are now beginning to witness

---

4 See Alan Mendelson, *Secular Education in Philo of Alexandria*, Monographs of the Hebrew Union College 7 (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College Press, 1982), among several others.

5 On Ben Sira, see in particular Martin Löhr, *Bildung aus dem Glauben. Beiträge zum Verständnis der Lehrreden des Buches Jesus Sirach* (Dissertation; Bonn 1975); Helge Stadelmann, *Ben Sira als Schriftgelehrter: Eine Untersuchung zum Berufsbild des vor-Makkabäischen Söfer unter Berücksichtigung seines Verhältnisses zu Priester-, Propheten- und Weisheitslehretum*, WUNT 2/6 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1981); Oda Wischmeyer, *Die Kultur des Buches Jesus Sirach*, BZNW 77 (Berlin: de Gruyter, 1995); Frank Ueberschaer, *Weisheit aus der Begegnung: Bildung nach dem Buch Ben Sira*, BZAW 379 (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2008). And on the Dead Sea Scrolls, see, e. g., Carol Newsom, "The Sage in the Literature of Qumran: The Functions of the *Maśkîl*," in *The Sage in Israel and the Ancient Near East*, ed. John G. Gammie and Leo G. Perdue (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1990), 373 – 382; Steven D. Fraade, "Interpretive Authority in the Studying Community at Qumran," *JJS* 44 (1993): 46 – 69; Emanuel Tov, "The Scribes of the Texts Found in the Judean Desert," in *The Quest for Context and Meaning: Studies* in *Biblical Intertextuality in Honor of James* A. *Sanders*, ed. C. A. Evans and S. Talmon (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 131 – 152; Tov, "The Text of the Hebrew/Aramaic and Greek Bible Used in the Ancient Synagogues," in *The Ancient Synagogue from Its Origins until 200 C.E. Papers Presented at an International Conference at Lund University, October 14 – 17, 2001*, ed. Birger Olsson and Magnus Zetterholm (Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 2003), 237 – 259; Armin Lange, "In Diskussion mit dem Temple: Zur Auseinandersetzung zwischen Kohelet und weisheitlichen Kreisen am Jerusalemer Tempel," in *Qohelet in the Context of Wisdom*, ed. A. Schoors (Louvain: Peeters, 1998), 113 – 159; and Bilhah Nitzan, "Education and Wisdom in the Dead Sea Scrolls in Light of their Background in Antiquity," in *New Perspectives on Old Texts. Proceedings of the Tenth International Symposium of the Orion Center for the Study of the Dead Sea Scrolls and Associated Literature, 9 – 11 January, 2005*, ed. Esther G. Chazon and Betsy Halpern-Amaru, STDS 88 (Leiden: Brill, 2010), 97 – 116.

6 See the studies of Samuel Byrskog, *Jesus the Only Teacher: Didactic Authority and Transmission in Ancient Israel, Ancient Judaism, and the Matthean Community*, Coniectanea Biblica: New Testament Series (Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1994); Robert S. Dutch, *The Educated Elite in 1 Corinthians: Education and Community Conflict in Graeco-Roman Context* (London: T&T Clark, 2005); Adam G. White, *Where is the Wise Man? Graeco-Roman Education as a Background to the Divisions in 1 Corinthians 1 – 4* (London: T&T Clark, 2010); and Matthew Ryan Hauge and Andrew W. Pitts, eds., *Ancient Education and Early Christianity* (London: T&T Clark, 2016).

7 David Carr's work, *Writing on the Tablet of the Heart* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), is probably the most thorough, but his focus on the textuality of the Bible leads him view education only through this narrow lens.

a shift and a growing interest in Jewish *paideia* more broadly, with several recent doctoral dissertations, conferences, and research groups exploring the subject from different methodological angles.[8]

It is within this context that the Fifth Nangeroni Meeting gathered from June 30 to July 4, 2015 in Naples, Italy, at the invitation of the Enoch Seminar and the University of Naples Federico II, and with the support of the FIRB research project under the direction of Luca Arcari: "The Construction of Space and Time in the Transmission of Collective Identities. Religious Cohabitations and/or Polarizations in the Ancient World (1st – 6th cent. CE)." The meeting was made up of eight major paper sessions, each of which featured a brief introduction by the author, a ten-minute response, and seventy minutes of moderated discussion. There were also three short paper sessions. All sessions were held at the University of Naples Federico II with the exception of the closing session on Saturday, which took place in the thirteenth-century castle Maschio Angioino. In addition, the participants and their guests had the chance to visit Pompeii and the Naples Archaeological Museum.

Founded in 2001 by Gabriele Boccaccini, the Enoch Seminar is an open and inclusive forum of international specialists in Second Temple Judaism and Christian Origins. Scholars with different methodologies and approaches and at various stages of their academic careers, meet and share the results of their research, addressing topics of common interest. Since 2011, the Nangeroni Meetings, promoted by the Enoch Seminar with the sponsorship of the Michigan Center for Early Christian Studies and the Alessandro Nangeroni International Endowment, have offered the opportunity for additional gatherings on specific topics in Jewish, Christian, and Islamic Origins. The closed nature of these meetings ensures an environment where the participants are free to share work in progress and to collaborate on inchoate ideas.[9]

The scholars who gathered in Naples, each an expert in various facets of the subject, came with the shared goal not to try to locate some sort of normative or

8 At the 2012, 2013, and 2014 Society of Biblical Literature annual meetings, the Wisdom and Apocalypticism in Early Judaism and Early Christianity group offered several sessions on early Jewish and Christian *paideia*, the results of which will be published later this year as *From Musar to Paideia: Pedagogy in Early Judaism and Christianity*, ed. Matthew Goff, Karina Martin Hogan, and Emma Wasserman (Atlanta: SBL, forthcoming). Additionally, a recent research group has been formed within the Courant Research Centre "Education and Religion" at the University of Göttingen, led by Tobias Georges and titled "Piety and Paideia. Religious Traditions and Intellectual Culture in the World of the Roman Empire," though their focus is on the second and third centuries CE rather than the Second Temple period.

9 Detailed and updated information on the Enoch Seminar and the Nangeroni Meetings are available online at www.enochseminar.org and www.4enoch.org.

common notion of Jewish education during the period, but to move towards a greater overall understanding by allowing the diversity of views to stand and speak for themselves.

The choice of the Greek term *paideia* instead of simply “education” in the title of the conference and this volume is telling of the significance of the subject beyond what we may typically associate with pedagogical or curricular matters. The term referred most basically to “education,” but it was much more. Plato would argue that *paideia* was not some simple training in a skill or occupation, but rather training in virtue and the means to becoming a cultured individual and true citizen (*Leg.* 1.643e). Thus, *paideia* could refer at once to the process of education and the end result of culture. Taking up the idea first found in Isocrates (*Panegyr.* 50), that it was a shared *paideia* rather than a shared bloodline that made an individual truly Greek, philosophers and rhetors of the Hellenistic and Roman periods understood *paideia* as a—maybe even the—defining characteristic of social and cultural identity.[10] While we must not assume a perfect correspondence between such Greek and Roman attitudes and those of Jews in the diaspora, let alone in Judea, they do often reflect the values placed on a proper Jewish education found in the literature, whether the term used is *paideia* or not.

The papers offered for discussion in Naples and revised for the present volume highlight well the importance of the concept for understanding the wider world of thought of the individual authors and the social and cultural lives of the Jewish people during the period. They also vividly demonstrate the necessity of collaboration and interdisciplinary dialogue in attempting to grasp such a foundational and multi-faceted topic as Jewish education. The essays have been divided along geographical lines, those that deal with texts or authors from the diaspora and those from Judea. This organizational strategy, however, is not meant to insinuate that such a divide necessarily existed, whether in ideology or practice. Parallels and/or differences cannot be assumed but, instead, must be evaluated on an individual basis.

10 See, e.g., Ps.-Plutarch, *Lib. Educ.* 5c–e. The connection between *paideia* and identity has been highlighted by Yun Lee Too, *The Rhetoric of Identity in Isocrates: Text, Power, Pedagogy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995); Jan-Jaap Flinterman, *Power, Paideia & Pythagoreanism: Greek Identity, Conceptions of the Relationship Between Philosophers & Monarchs & Political Ideas in Philostratus' Life of Apollonius*, Dutch Monographs on Ancient History and Archaeology 13 (Leiden: Brill, 1995); Teresa Morgan, *Literate Education in the Hellenistic and Roman Worlds* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998); Simon Goldhill, ed., *Being Greek under Rome: Cultural Identity, the Second Sophistic and the Development of Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001); Tim Whitmarsh, *Greek Literature and the Roman Empire: The Politics of Imitation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001); and idem., *Narrative and Identity in the Ancient Greek Novel: Returning Romance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011).

The first part, Jewish Education in Palestine, opens with Bill Schniedewind's paper on the social location of scribal education at the transition from the Iron Age to the Persian period. Schniedewind finds a shift between the periods in linguistic ideology or politics. In the Iron Age, the primary function of a scribal education would have been in service to the state bureaucracy, with a secondary religious role. The language of this education, in both cases, was Hebrew. Instead, in the Persian period, scribal education became segregated by language, with Aramaic as the official language of the bureaucracy and Hebrew used to reinforce religious traditions and identity.

Three authors take up Ben Sira's views on education from unique perspectives. Frank Ueberschaer offers an overview of the author's many different statements on proper teaching and learning and the important responsibility the inspired sage has to Israel. In the end, Ben Sira's teaching, traditional yet innovative, reflects his attempt to redefine Judaism and Jewish life in response to the changing circumstances of Hellenistic Judea. Samuel Adams looks anew at the long-running scholarly debate over Ben Sira's supposed particularism and rejection of Hellenism. A focus on the author's own pedagogy reveals, instead, a far more ecumenical attitude, open to foreign wisdom and outside perspectives. Elisa Uusimäki focuses her study on the intellectual and spiritual exercises the sage must undertake to acquire wisdom. Drawing on Pierre Hadot's work on Greco-Roman philosophy as a series of exercises designed to transform one's way of living, Uusimäki finds several parallel activities in Ben Sira, including teaching, scribal activities, contemplation, and prayer. The various exercises help to form a life of virtue and are integral in the development of the sage.

Matthew Goff's paper on education in the Dead Sea Scrolls and the *yaḥad* closes the first part of the volume. Goff's overview demonstrates that the pedagogy within the community centered on the Torah, which went beyond the bounds of the Pentateuch itself to include other authoritative writings and instruction from authoritative teachers, such as the Teacher of Righteousness, who were needed to provide access to esoteric, revealed knowledge. Despite the strict Torah-centric education, Goff does not find any evidence for a sort of anti-Hellenistic counter curriculum as has been suggested by scholars like Elias Bickerman or David Carr.

Part two, Jewish Education in the Diaspora, begins with Ben Wright's study on Greek *paideia* and the Letter of Aristeas. Reading the text in light of contemporary Greek intellectual culture, Wright shows that the author had a relatively advanced level of Greek education that included rhetorical training. The author utilized several of the rhetorical techniques found in the *progymnasmata*, including *ekphrasis*, the *chreia*, and *synkrisis*, and makes frequent use of Greek sources and philosophical traditions. The demonstration of this Greek *paideia* reinforces

Wright's view of the author as a Hellene who happened to be a Jew, whose Jewish ethnic identity was important to him but who could move comfortably in Greek cultural circles. The near contemporary Aristobulus also possessed an advanced Greek education, as Luca Arcari demonstrates, showing, via the collected materials known as the Testament of Orpheus, the author's adoption of common Alexandrian exegetical strategies.

Patrick Pouchelle looks at the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs and the patterns of paternal education found therein, which included disciplinary rebuke, the handing down of customs, traditions, and identity, and the teaching of writing, the last of which innovatively and explicitly links literacy and Jewish culture. Greg Sterling and Sean Adams both seek to locate the works of Philo of Alexandria within an educational setting. Sterling posits the existence of a private school of Jewish exegesis run by Philo in Alexandria. Looking at the curricula of such Hellenistic and late antique philosophical schools as those of Epictetus, Plotinus, and Proclus, Sterling then shows how Philo's works would have been utilized in his own school. Adams, instead, focuses on Philo's *Questions and Answers* in light of the use of other "Questions" literature, and sees them plausibly functioning in an educational setting.

Anders Klostergaard Petersen explores three unique manifestations of Jewish *paideia*, in the Wisdom of Solomon, 4 Maccabees, and Philo, and how they help to reveal the ambiguity in the dichotomy between philosophy and religion in the ancient world. 4 Maccabees is also the subject of David deSilva's detailed study, which examines the author's own *paideia* as evinced from his work. The mastery of Greek language and literature, Greek rhetorical techniques, and philosophical ethics reveals an author whose advanced Greek education was seamlessly woven together with Jewish cultural literacy, the former used to promote the value of the latter.

Kathy Ehrensperger discusses the problems involved with Paul trying to teach a new set of values and social behaviors to those in his communities who had been educated in the elite male discourse of the time. To overcome the difficulties, Paul embodied those aspects of his own Jewish traditions and of the Christ-event which he hoped to pass on. Finally, Jason von Ehrenkrook closes the volume by looking at how the grave importance we have seen attached to *paideia* during the Second Temple Period carries over into late antiquity. Von Ehrenkrook sees the discourses of proper *paideia* by Eusebius, Athanasius, and Eunapius as a window into the cultural competition and contested boundaries of identity during the period.

If we were to seek some similarity among the wide diversity of views found in the unique historical and cultural contexts discussed throughout the essays it would be the fundamental role of education in individual and communal self-

understanding and self-representation. *Paideia* provides a unique vantage point from which to view the continual reimagining, reshaping, and deployment of identity. It thus proves an invaluable, and underutilized, asset in our goal of a greater historical understanding of the Second Temple period. This idea will be explored further in the volume's concluding essay.

Participants of the Fifth Nangeroni Meeting (June 30—July 4, 2015, Naples):

Samuel Adams, Union Presbyterian Seminary
Sean Adams, University of Glasgow
Luca Arcari, University of Naples Federico II
Gabriele Boccaccini, University of Michigan
Francis Borchardt, Lutheran Theological Seminary Hong Kong
Daniel Boyarin, University of California Berkeley
Brian Capper, Canterbury Christ Church University
Rodney Caruthers, University of Michigan
James Charlesworth, Princeton Theological Seminary
Paolo Collini, Florence, Italy
David deSilva, Ashland Theological Seminary
Kathy Ehrensperger, University of Wales, Trinity Saint David
Gregory Goering, University of Virginia
Matthew Goff, Florida State University
Robert Hall, Hampden-Sydney College
Vered Hillel, MJTI
David Jackson, William Carey Christian School
Anders Klostergaard Petersen, University of Aarhus
Patrick Pouchelle, Centre Sèvres, Paris
Tessa Rajak, University of Reading
William Schniedewind, University of California Los Angeles
Gregory Sterling, Yale University
Steve Tinney, University of Pennsylvania
Frank Ueberschaer, University of Zurich
Elisa Uusimäki, University of Helsinki
Jacqueline Vayntrub, Brandeis University
Jason von Ehrenkrook, University of Massachusetts-Boston
Benjamin Wright, Lehigh University
Jason Zurawski, University of Groningen